# 2013 -- S 0471 SUBSTITUTE A

LC01767/SUB A

\_\_\_\_\_

3

# STATE OF RHODE ISLAND

## IN GENERAL ASSEMBLY

#### JANUARY SESSION, A.D. 2013

#### AN ACT

#### RELATING TO COURTS AND CIVIL PROCEDURE - COURTS - JUDICIAL SELECTION

Introduced By: Senator Maryellen Goodwin

Date Introduced: February 28, 2013

Referred To: Senate Judiciary

It is enacted by the General Assembly as follows:

SECTION 1. Section 8-16.1-6 of the General Laws in Chapter 8-16.1 entitled "Judicial
 Selection" is hereby amended to read as follows:

8-16.1-6. Nomination and appointment of judges. [Repealed effective June 30, 2013.]

Momination and appointment of judges [Repealed effective June 30, 2014.] -- (a) (1) The governor shall immediately notify the commission of any vacancy or prospective vacancy of a judge of any state court other than the Rhode Island supreme court. The commission shall advertise for each vacancy and solicit prospective candidates and shall consider names submitted from any source. Within ninety (90) days of any vacancy the commission shall publicly submit the names of not less than three (3) and not more than five (5) highly qualified persons for each vacancy to the governor.

(2) Notwithstanding any other law to the contrary, any individual whose name was publicly submitted to the governor by the commission as described in subsection (1) above, shall also be eligible for subsequent nomination by the governor for any vacancy or prospective vacancy of a judge in the same court for which that particular individual had previously applied except for a vacancy in the position of presiding justice, chief justice, or chief judge.

(3) Such individuals shall remain eligible for nomination to fill any vacancy or
prospective vacancy within the same court to which they previously applied for a period of five
(5) years from the date their name or names were publicly submitted to the governor by the
commission unless such individuals withdraw from future consideration in writing to the judicial

nominating commission. However, such individuals must reapply for any subsequent vacancy or
 prospective vacancy in the same court for the position of presiding justice, chief justice, or chief
 judge.

4 (4) Subject to the eligibility requirements set forth above, the governor shall fill any 5 vacancy of any judge of the Rhode Island superior court, family court, district court, workers' compensation court, or any other state court which the general assembly may from time to time 6 7 establish, by nominating one of the three (3) to five (5) highly qualified persons forwarded to him 8 or her by the commission for the court where the vacancy occurs, or by nominating another 9 individual who has previously applied for a vacancy or prospective vacancy within the same court 10 and whose name had been previously publicly submitted to the governor within the previous five 11 (5) years.

(b) The governor shall fill any vacancy within twenty-one (21) days of the publicsubmission by the commission.

14 (c) Each nomination shall be delivered forthwith to the secretary of the senate for 15 presentation to the senate, and by and with the advice and consent of the senate, each nominee 16 shall be appointed by the governor to serve subject to the general laws. The senate shall, after 17 seven (7) calendar days of receipt of the nomination consider the nomination, but if the senate 18 fails within ninety (90) days after the submission to confirm the nominee or if the senate does not 19 by a majority vote of its members extend the deliberation an additional seven (7) calendar days, 20 the governor shall appoint some other person to fill the vacancy and shall submit his or her 21 appointment to the senate for confirmation in like manner until the senate shall confirm the 22 nomination. If the nominee is rejected by the senate, the commission shall submit a new list of 23 three (3) to five (5) candidates to the governor for the purpose of nomination in accordance with 24 this chapter. Any new list may include but need not be limited to the names of any candidates 25 who were previously submitted to the governor by the commission but who were not forwarded 26 to the senate for its advice and consent.

27 (d) During the time for consideration of the nominees by the senate, the senate judiciary 28 committee shall conduct an investigation and public hearing on the question of the qualifications 29 of the nominee or nominees. At the public hearing, the testimony of every witness shall be taken 30 under oath and stenographic records shall be taken and maintained. Further, the senate judiciary 31 committee shall during the course of its investigation and hearing have the power upon majority 32 vote of the committee members present to issue witness subpoenas, subpoenas duces tecum, and 33 orders for the production of books, accounts, papers, records, and documents which shall be 34 signed and issued by the chairperson of the committee, or the person serving in his or her

1 capacity. All such subpoenas and orders shall be served as subpoenas in civil cases in the superior 2 court are served, and witnesses so subpoenaed shall be entitled to the same fees for attendance 3 and travel as provided for witnesses in civil cases in the superior court. If the person subpoenaed 4 to attend before the committee fails to obey the command of the subpoena without reasonable 5 cause, refuse to be sworn, or to be examined, or to answer a legal and pertinent question, or if any person shall refuse to produce books, accounts, papers, records, and documents material to the 6 issue, set forth in an order duly served on him or her, the committee by majority vote of the 7 8 committee members present may apply to any justice of the superior court, for any county, upon 9 proof by affidavit of the fact, for a rule or order returnable in not less than two (2) nor more than 10 five (5) days, directing the person to show cause before the justice who made the order or any 11 other justice of the superior court, why he or she should not be adjudged in contempt. Upon the 12 return of the order, the justice before whom the matter is brought on for hearing shall examine 13 under oath the person, and the person shall be given an opportunity to be heard, and if the justice 14 shall determine that the person has refused without reasonable cause or legal excuse to be 15 examined or to answer a legal and pertinent question, or to produce books, accounts, papers, 16 records, and documents material to the issue which he or she was ordered to bring or produce, he 17 or she may forthwith commit the offender to the adult correctional institution, there to remain 18 until the person submits to do the act which he or she was so required to do, or is discharged 19 according to law.

(e) The committee shall, for the purpose of investigating the qualifications of the nominee or nominees, be furnished with a report compiled by the state police in conjunction with the attorney general's office indicating the determinations and findings of the state police and attorney general's office investigations concerning the background of the nominee or nominees, and the report shall include, but not be limited to, the following:

(1) Whether the nominee has ever been convicted of or pleaded guilty to a misdemeanor
or felony in this or any other state or foreign country;

(2) Whether the nominee has ever filed a personal bankruptcy petition or an assignment for the benefit of creditors in this or any other state or foreign country; and whether the nominee has ever been a partner in, held ten percent (10%) or more of stock in, or held office in any sole proprietorship, partnership, or corporation that has been involved in bankruptcy or receivership actions as a debtor or because of insolvency at the time the nominee was a partner in, held ten percent (10%) or more stock in, or held office in any such sole proprietorship, partnership, or corporation;

34

(3) Whether the nominee has ever had a civil judgment rendered against him or her

1 arising out of an allegation of fraud, misrepresentation, libel, slander, professional negligence, or 2 any intentional tort in this state or any other state or foreign country;

3 (4) The state police in conjunction with the attorney general's department shall provide 4 in their report the names and addresses of each and every source of their information.

5 (f) The reports set forth in this section shall be delivered to the chairperson and members of the senate judiciary committee in addition to the nominee or nominees only prior to the 6 7 commencement of the public hearing. Provided, however, that if the nominee or nominees 8 withdraw or decline the appointment prior to the public hearing then the report or reports shall be 9 returned to the chairperson of the judiciary committee and destroyed.

10 (g) The committee shall also require a financial statement to be submitted by each 11 nominee, prior to the public hearing, to the chairperson of the senate judiciary committee, to 12 investigate each nominee to determine his or her compliance with the provisions of chapter 14 of 13 title 36.

14 (h) Any associate justice of any state court who is appointed to serve as the chief or 15 presiding justice of that court on an interim basis shall retain his or her status as an associate 16 justice until the appointment to chief or presiding justice is made permanent.

17 (i) In case a vacancy shall occur when the senate is not in session, the governor shall 18 appoint some person from a list of three (3) to five (5) persons submitted to the governor by the 19 commission to fill the vacancy until the senate shall next convene, when the governor shall make 20 an appointment as provided in this section.

21 8-16.1-6. Nomination and appointment of judges. [Effective June 30, 2012.] --22 Nomination and appointment of judges. [Effective June 30, 2014.] -- (a) The governor shall 23 immediately notify the commission of any vacancy or prospective vacancy of a judge of any state 24 court other than the Rhode Island supreme court. The commission shall advertise for each 25 vacancy and solicit prospective candidates and shall consider names submitted from any source. 26 Within ninety (90) days of any vacancy the commission shall publicly submit the names of not 27 less than three (3) and not more than five (5) highly qualified persons for each vacancy to the 28 governor. The governor shall fill any vacancy of any judge of the Rhode Island superior court, 29 family court, district court, workers' compensation court, or any other state court which the 30 general assembly may from time to time establish, by nominating one of the three (3) to five (5) 31 highly qualified persons forwarded to him or her by the commission for the court where the 32 vacancy occurs.

33 (b) The governor shall fill any vacancy within twenty-one (21) days of the public 34 submission by the commission.

1 (c) Each nomination shall be forwarded forthwith to the senate, and by and with the 2 advice and consent of the senate, each nominee shall be appointed by the governor to serve 3 subject to the general laws. The senate shall, after seven (7) calendar days of receipt of the 4 nomination consider the nomination, but if the senate fails within ninety (90) days after the 5 submission to confirm the nominee or if the senate does not by a majority vote of its members extend the deliberation an additional seven (7) calendar days, the governor shall appoint some 6 7 other person to fill the vacancy and shall submit his or her appointment to the senate for 8 confirmation in like manner until the senate shall confirm the nomination. If the nominee is 9 rejected by the senate, the commission shall submit a new list of three (3) to five (5) candidates to 10 the governor for the purpose of nomination in accordance with this chapter. Any new list may 11 include but need not be limited to the names of any candidates who were previously submitted to 12 the governor by the commission but who were not forwarded to the senate for its advice and 13 consent.

14 (d) During the time for consideration of the nominees by the senate, the senate judiciary 15 committee shall conduct an investigation and public hearing on the question of the qualifications 16 of the nominee or nominees. At the public hearing, the testimony of every witness shall be taken 17 under oath and stenographic records shall be taken and maintained. Further, the senate judiciary 18 committee shall during the course of its investigation and hearing have the power upon majority 19 vote of the committee members present to issue witness subpoenas, subpoenas duces tecum, and 20 orders for the production of books, accounts, papers, records, and documents which shall be 21 signed and issued by the chairperson of the committee, or the person serving in his or her 22 capacity. All such subpoenas and orders shall be served as subpoenas in civil cases in the superior 23 court are served, and witnesses so subpoenaed shall be entitled to the same fees for attendance 24 and travel as provided for witnesses in civil cases in the superior court. If the person subpoenaed 25 to attend before the committee fails to obey the command of the subpoena without reasonable 26 cause, refuse to be sworn, or to be examined, or to answer a legal and pertinent question, or if any 27 person shall refuse to produce books, accounts, papers, records, and documents material to the 28 issue, set forth in an order duly served on him or her, the committee by majority vote of the 29 committee members present may apply to any justice of the superior court, for any county, upon 30 proof by affidavit of the fact, for a rule or order returnable in not less than two (2) nor more than 31 five (5) days, directing the person to show cause before the justice who made the order or any 32 other justice of the superior court, why he or she should not be adjudged in contempt. Upon the 33 return of the order, the justice before whom the matter is brought on for hearing shall examine 34 under oath the person, and the person shall be given an opportunity to be heard, and if the justice

shall determine that the person has refused without reasonable cause or legal excuse to be examined or to answer a legal and pertinent question, or to produce books, accounts, papers, records, and documents material to the issue which he or she was ordered to bring or produce, he or she may forthwith commit the offender to the adult correctional institution, there to remain until the person submits to do the act which he or she was so required to do, or is discharged according to law.

7 (e) The committee shall, for the purpose of investigating the qualifications of the 8 nominee or nominees, be furnished with a report compiled by the state police in conjunction with 9 the attorney general's office indicating the determinations and findings of the state police and 10 attorney general's office investigations concerning the background of the nominee or nominees, 11 and the report shall include, but not be limited to, the following:

(1) Whether the nominee has ever been convicted of or pleaded guilty to a misdemeanoror felony in this or any other state or foreign country;

(2) Whether the nominee has ever filed a personal bankruptcy petition or an assignment for the benefit of creditors in this or any other state or foreign country; and whether the nominee has ever been a partner in, held ten percent (10%) or more of stock in, or held office in any sole proprietorship, partnership, or corporation that has been involved in bankruptcy or receivership actions as a debtor or because of insolvency at the time the nominee was a partner in, held ten percent (10%) or more stock in, or held office in any such sole proprietorship, partnership, or corporation;

(3) Whether the nominee has ever had a civil judgment rendered against him or her
arising out of an allegation of fraud, misrepresentation, libel, slander, professional negligence, or
any intentional tort in this state or any other state or foreign country;

(4) The state police in conjunction with the attorney general's department shall providein their report the names and addresses of each and every source of their information.

(f) The reports set forth in this section shall be delivered to the chairperson and members of the senate judiciary committee in addition to the nominee or nominees only prior to the commencement of the public hearing. Provided, however, that if the nominee or nominees withdraw or decline the appointment prior to the public hearing then the report or reports shall be returned to the chairperson of the judiciary committee and destroyed.

31 (g) The committee shall also require a financial statement to be submitted by each 32 nominee, prior to the public hearing, to the chairperson of the senate judiciary committee, to 33 investigate each nominee to determine his or her compliance with the provisions of chapter 14 of 34 title 36. (h) Any associate justice of any state court who is appointed to serve as the chief or
 presiding justice of that court on an interim basis shall retain his or her status as an associate
 justice until the appointment to chief or presiding justice is made permanent.

4 (i) In case a vacancy shall occur when the senate is not in session, the governor shall 5 appoint some person from a list of three (3) to five (5) persons submitted to the governor by the 6 commission to fill the vacancy until the senate shall next convene, when the governor shall make 7 an appointment as provided in this section.

8 SECTION 2. This act shall take effect upon passage and shall be applied retroactively to 9 June 30, 2013. For purposes of providing clarity, the expressed legislative intent of this act is that 10 any individual on a list of judicial candidates as of June 30, 2013, shall remain on that list until 11 June 30, 2014, unless that individual is actually confirmed as a judge prior to June 30, 2014.

LC01767/SUB A

#### **EXPLANATION**

#### BY THE LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL

## OF

# AN ACT

## RELATING TO COURTS AND CIVIL PROCEDURE - COURTS - JUDICIAL SELECTION

\*\*\*

1 This act would make any individual whose name was publicly submitted to the governor 2 by the judicial nominating commission, eligible for subsequent nomination by the governor until 3 June 30, 2014, for any vacancy or prospective vacancy of a judge in the same court for which that 4 particular individual had previously applied except for a vacancy in the position of presiding 5 justice, chief justice, or chief judge. 6 This act would take effect upon passage and would be applied retroactively to June 30, 7 2013. For purposes of providing clarity, the expressed legislative intent of this act is that any 8 individual on a list of judicial candidates as of June 30, 2013, would remain on that list until June 30, 2014, unless that individual were actually confirmed as a judge prior to June 30, 2014. 9

10

LC01767/SUB A

\_\_\_\_